



37th Executive Committee meeting: 12/13 June 2017

Agenda and Compilation of meeting papers

Date and time		
	12 June	13 June
New Zealand		10:00 (NZST)
France	Midnight (CEST)	
Canada	18:00 (EDT)	
Morocco	22:00 (WET)	
Hong Kong		6:00 (HKT)

Dialling Instructions				
New Zealand	Canada	France	Morocco	Hong Kong
+649 379 4086	+649 379 4086	+649 379 4086	+649 379 4086	+649 379 4086

Once connected enter Conference call code: 859 701 8468 followed by #
For operator assistance at any time please dial *0

Item 1: Adopt agenda, note apologies

ICDPPC Executive Committee Agenda

37th meeting of ICDPPC Executive Committee

12/13 June 2017

Meeting scheduled for 60 minutes

Agenda

1. Formalities: Apologies/ adopt agenda
2. Previous meeting (April 2017): Approve minutes of 36th meeting, review action points
3. 39th Conference: Closed session plans (Chair)
4. 41st Conference in 2019 (Secretariat)
5. Committee and Secretariat transition (Secretariat)
6. Discussion of project on future size and membership of Conference (Chair/Secretariat)
7. Preliminary discussion on new process for endorsing enforcement cooperation meetings (Secretariat)
8. General business
9. Next meeting
22/23 August

Item 2: Previous meeting (19th April 2017): Approve minutes of 36th meeting

ICDPPC Executive Committee Minutes

36th Meeting of ICDPPC Executive Committee 19 April 2017

Chair: John Edwards, New Zealand
Canada: Daniel Therrien, Andrea Rousseau, Miguel Bernal-Castillero
Hong Kong: Stephen Wong, Ivan Chan
Morocco: Lahoussine Aniss

As observers: Giovannie Buttarelli (European Data Protection Supervisor)
Ventislav Karadjov (Commission for Personal Data Protection of Bulgaria)

Apologies: Isabelle Falque-Pierrotin, France; Said Ihrai, Morocco; Blair Stewart (Secretariat)

Meeting opened: 18:06 (EST)

1. Previous meeting (14/15 February 2017) and action points:

Minutes approved with HK's amendment.

2. 39th Conference: selection of closed session topic

The Chair updated on Committee member's responses to the Secretariat's consultation, which did not result in immediate consensus on a single topic. Suggestion for Smart Cities to be included in the open session agenda.

Upon discussion of preferences – including that the topic of government information sharing exclude matters of national security and intelligence – members approved a combination of the topics of *Safe Government Information Sharing* and *Sensitive Data: Discrimination and Risk Management*.

Action Item:

- Secretariat and Canada to finalise topic title and propose a list of suggested speakers.

3. Discussion of project on future size and membership of Conference

The Chair provided an update. To date, only three Working Group members have provided feedback (all supportive) on the draft survey. The deadline for comments was extended to April 20, after which the Secretariat will review the proposed edits and send an updated survey to the Working Group.

Via email, France suggested to add a list of scenarios to the open questions. Noting the current delays and the possibility for the scenarios to be brought into the Working Group's discussion, it was decided to send the survey as currently conceived. The Working Group would revisit France's proposal, along with other proposals, as part of its post-survey analysis task.

Action Item:

- Survey to proceed and its results to be discussed at the next Committee meeting.

4. Committee transition

The Chair noted that, post-39th Conference, the ExCo seat reserved for the future host will belong to the EDPS and Bulgaria as co-hosts. This situation is not contemplated in the ICDPPC Rules. The co-hosts agree that they should share the single seat but indicated they are open to the Committee's

suggestion on how best to proceed (internal coordination between the co-hosts; intermittent or yearly rotation; allow both on the Committee). No decision taken, but to be considered at next Committee meeting.

The Chair also brought up the matter of transitioning to a new Chair and Secretariat once NZ steps down at the Hong Kong conference. Noting the resource burden that being Chair and Secretariat can represent, Committee members were invited to think of how to manage or share that burden so whoever succeeds in the role is well supported.

Canada indicated its intention to remain on the Committee but would not conclude on whether to seek selection as Chair. Other possibilities remain, including whether new elected member would like to be Chair.

Action Item:

- Secretariat to prepare and circulate a document to report the tasks required of the Secretariat and how NZ has resourced those tasks so Committee members can make a more informed decision. This item is to be included in the agenda of the next meeting.

5. Update from selected host of 40th Conference

EDPS and Bulgaria presented their report, noting that they have submitted budgetary request to relevant domestic and regional institutions. Knowledge transfer with past hosts is on-going. An invitation video is being prepared to present in HK; other details will be shared publicly only after the conclusion of the 39th Conference so as not to detract from it.

6. 41st Conference in 2019

The Chair updated the committee on the reception of multiple submissions to host the 41st Conference.

7. ICDPPC recognised enforcement cooperation meeting 2017

Proposal from the UK ICO was considered and approved.

8. General business

CA provided an oral update on the Working Group on Enforcement Cooperation. A meeting of the Group of Experts was held in Toronto earlier in April; a written report will follow.

MO provided an update on accreditation applications and will provide its assessments in advance of the next Committee meeting.

Next meeting:

12/13 June via teleconference.

Meeting closed: 19:03 (EST)

Action points from previous meeting

Task	Committee Member	Notes
Secretariat and Canada to finalise topic title and propose a list of suggested speakers	Secretariat and CA	
Survey to proceed and its results to be discussed at the next Committee meeting	Secretariat	
Secretariat to prepare and circulate a document to report the tasks required of the Secretariat and how NZ has resourced those tasks so Committee members can make a more informed decision.	Secretariat	Complete

Item 3: 39th Conference: Closed session plans (Chair)

2 June 2017

Note from the Secretariat: CA and the Secretariat are working on developing a closed session plan and will submit a more concrete plan as a later paper before the ExCo meeting.

Item 4: 41st Conference in 2019 (Secretariat)

Evaluation of proposals to host the 41st Conference in 2019

Report by the Secretariat

18 May 2017

Action required by Executive Committee at meeting: As all three proposals are equally strong the Secretariat recommends the Executive Committee review all the three hosting proposals along with the Secretariat's report and select an applicant to be recommended as the host for the 41st Conference in 2019.

Introduction

The Executive Committee delegated the evaluation of the 2019 hosting proposals to the evaluation sub-committee of [REDACTED] and the Secretariat.

Three hosting proposals were received from

- [REDACTED]
- [REDACTED]
- [REDACTED]

Process

■ and the Secretariat independently scored the proposals against the agreed [criteria](#).

The criteria focusses on the overall strengths of the proposal, closed and public session and side events, organisational ability, location and venue which include personal safety and human rights, financial ability and key matters addressing the objectives of the Conference.

Proposals were evaluated with the information supplied and where matters needed further clarity the Secretariat sought additional information from one applicant.

Evaluation

All three proposals were credible and equally strong. The proposal documents and additional information obtained by the Secretariat will be supplied as separate attachments to the Committee.

The three proposals were individually scored by ■ and the Secretariat. The Secretariat then combined the scores and added agreed weightings. In addition to uplifts used for the last 3 evaluations, we gave even higher weightings to certain elements related to experience, resourcing and desirability of moving the Conference around.

As well as numerical scores we offer a letter based scoring: A+ to D- (based upon the [University of Auckland grade scale](#)). The letters seek to allow one to avoid getting hung up on small differences in numerical scores that can convey a slightly spurious feeling of objectivity.

Criteria						
		Max points	Subcommittee scores		Subcommittee scores	
A	Overview of Strengths of Proposal	■	■	■	■	■
B	Closed session, Public & Side events	■	■	■	■	■
C	Organisation	■	■	■	■	■
D	Location & Venue	■	■	■	■	■
E	Finances	■	■	■	■	■
F	Key Matters	■	■	■	■	■
TOTALS		■	■	■	■	■

■
■
■

Strengths and weaknesses (when compared to each other)

All three were supportable proposals. These are the features that might set them each slightly apart although these differences should not necessarily be seen as the only important considerations (e.g. they all offered suitable venues, as this was a commonality I don't mention the fact in my survey of strengths and weaknesses). These are not necessarily characteristics volunteered by the proposers themselves.

Proposal	Strength ✓	Weakness ×
■	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ [Redacted] ■ [Redacted] ■ [Redacted] ■ [Redacted] ■ [Redacted] 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ [Redacted]

[Redacted]	[Redacted]	[Redacted]
[Redacted]	[Redacted]	[Redacted]

Item 5: Committee and Secretariat transition (Secretariat)

Quantifying the ICDPPC Secretariat resource requirements

Blair Stewart, ICDPPC Secretariat, 9 May 2017

Introduction

This note is intended to assist future Executive Committee Chairs to anticipate the resource that might be needed to provide an ICDPPC Secretariat. It is based on NZ's 2½ years' experience of delivering the Secretariat from October 2014 to April 2017.

Each Secretariat will perform its functions slightly differently. However, there will be certain constants such as maintaining the website and serving the Executive Committee meetings.

The NZ term has been deliberately marked by a number of 'firsts' such as the creation of the website. These have often been comparatively resource intensive to establish but the ongoing maintenance effort for future Secretariats will be correspondingly lighter. (Although it is to be hoped that future Chairs will also wish to initiate additional 'firsts' to take the Conference to new heights.)

The core Secretariat function in rule 3.1 is the "management and preservation of the documents and files of the Conference" which is now delivered by means of the permanent website repository. A scan of the rules will find some other Secretariat functions listed. However, the rules do not provide a comprehensive list of responsibilities and, in effect, anything that needs to be done under the rules that is not a host responsibility will fall onto the Secretariat unless otherwise delegated by decision of the Executive Committee.

In addition to responsibilities under the rules, roles tend to devolve upon the Secretariat by tradition, Executive Committee decision, Chair's decision or resolution. If an Executive Committee is particularly keen to advance the action plan, or if a Chair has an ambitious programme, it follows that the Secretariat workload will increase. Occasionally resolutions place burdens upon the Secretariat (e.g. ongoing tasks under a series of enforcement cooperation resolutions).

This note does not seek to quantify the Chair's costs, where those are unconnected with Secretariat duties (e.g. travel to Tunisia to represent ICDPPC at ITU not covered).

Routine Secretariat tasks

In addition to project based work that has its own timetable and resource needs, the ICDPPC Secretariat has a set of predictable core tasks. These revolve around a 12 month cycle, between annual meetings, and an approximately 2 month cycle, between Executive Committee meetings.

These might be summarised as:

Annual Cycle

Phase	Month after Annual meeting	Secretariat task
Conference	0	Assists chair, takes minutes, reports, communique, services 2 ExCo meetings, etc.
Follow up from previous conference	0-2	Publish a conference report, formats and publishes resolutions, , satisfaction survey, member communication
Setting up for new work	1-4	Completes ExCo task allocation, set up year's schedule of meetings,

		develops work plan, establishes new working group, project work, services 1 or 2 ExCo meetings, member communication
Project work	4-8	Services 1 or 2 ExCo meetings, project work, services 1 or 2 ExCo meetings, member communication
Preparing for Conference	9-10	Services 1 or 2 ExCo meetings, project work, planning for Committee transition, processing accreditations, preparing Day 2 closed session
	11-12	Resolutions, report writing, etc.
Conference	12	Assists chair, takes minutes, reports, communique, services 2 ExCo meetings, etc.

Bi-monthly cycle

Phase	Week after ExCo meeting	Secretariat task
ExCo meeting	0	Take minutes, present reports
Follow up	0-1	Draft minutes for Chair's approval, circulate action points, post approved minutes from previous ExCo meeting to website
	1-3	Circulate draft minutes to ExCo, publish and circulate a newsletter to members incl. a summary ExCo meeting report, commission articles for next newsletter
Preparation	4-5	Circulate a draft agenda for next ExCo meeting, prepare meeting papers, chase reports
	6	Circulate a compilation of meeting papers with revised agenda and corrected minutes, teleconference call in instructions (at least a week in advance of meeting)
ExCo meeting	8	Activate teleconference including call recording, take minutes, present reports, etc.

Staff assigned to ICDPPC Secretariat tasks

NZ has assigned 3 staff to service the ICDPPC Secretariat being:

- A manager (Assistant Commissioner)
- A policy adviser
- An Executive Assistant.

It is difficult to quantify the time spent on ICDPPC Secretariat tasks by each of these staff but overall each is likely to have spent in excess of 25% of their time on the Secretariat work. The policy adviser will have spent perhaps 50% of her time over the 2½ years.

The Commissioner will each year also have spent a number of days cumulatively on ICDPPC business. Some other staff have been involved to a minor extent.

Staff costs are therefore likely to have exceeded 1.24 FTEs and to have exceeded 100,000 NZD p.a.

Some level of office overheads could notionally be allocated to this staff commitment.

External expenses

Each year the ICDPPC Secretariat hosts between 10-20 ICDPPC-related teleconferences. Added to the 6 or so formal ExCo meetings are various scheduled calls related to regular or ad hoc matters such as working groups, accreditation, host selection and host-liaison. For most such calls the Secretariat bears only the set up and NZ-connection costs. For the ExCo meetings an added cost of

recordings is made. Cost of teleconference for ExCo meetings including the cost of recording is roughly 2950 NZD.

The main external costs relate to the construction and maintenance of the ICDPPC permanent website (and related online presences such as Twitter and YouTube). The costs tend to be of the following types:

- Expert advice;
- Construction of website and subsequent changes;
- Maintenance;
- Subscriptions and licences.

Website and related costs since February 2015 have been in the region of 11200 NZD.

Annual standard website costs: 902.05 NZD

Website monitoring and backup	250
Hosting plan	228.85
Domain name	44.85
Dedicated IP address	69
SSL certificate	79.35
Gravity forms license (for accreditation applications)	50
Microsoft Office 365 business essentials plan	180
TOTAL	902.05

Item 6: Discussion of project on future size and membership of Conference (Chair/Secretariat)

1 June 2017

Note from Secretariat: The survey on the future size and membership was sent to the Conference membership on 18th May. The survey is open till 9th June.

So far 44 members have completed the survey. The secretariat will submit a late paper on the results of the survey before the ExCo meeting.

**Item 7: Preliminary discussion on new process
for endorsing enforcement cooperation meetings
(Secretariat)**

31 May 2017

Note from the Secretariat:

In August 2016 the Secretariat developed [guidance](#) for authorities seeking to have an event designated as an ICDPPC-recognised enforcement cooperation meeting. In addition the Secretariat published a [resource paper](#) to assist authorities that are proposing to hold, or are organising an ICDPPC-recognised enforcement cooperation meetings.

The Secretariat has run the process twice since 2016 and the Executive Committee has endorsed 3 meetings.

The Secretariat thought it was timely to have a preliminary discussion on the process and to know if the process is satisfactory.

Item 8: General business

Next meeting: 22/ 23 August via teleconference

	22 August	23 August
New Zealand		10:00
France	Midnight Tues- Wed	
Canada	18:00	
Morocco	23:00	
Hong Kong		6:00